Nashville MTA Board Meeting

Music City Center
201 5th Avenue South | Room 103AB | Nashville, TN 37203
June 27, 2019 | 2:30 p.m.

Board Members: 
Gail Carr Williams, Chair
Janet Miller, Vice Chair
Glenn Farner
Hannah Paramore Breen
Walter Searcy

1. Call to Order
2. Approval of May 23, 2019 Minutes
3. Public Comments*
4. Operations & Finance Committee – Walter Searcy, Chair
   - MTA/RTA Contract Renewal for Regional Transit Service  M-A-19-017  Pg. 6
   - Memorandum of Agreement with Metro Nashville Information Technology Services  M-A-19-019  Pg. 8
5. New Initiatives & Community Engagement Committee – Janet Miller, Chair
   - Authorization of 2019 Fare Changes and Service Reductions and Adjustments  M-A-19-020  Pg. 10
   - FY2020 Proposed Adoption of Continuation Budget  M-A-19-021  Pg. 18
6. Chair’s Report
7. Chief Executive Officer’s Report
8. Other Business
9. Adjourn

* Please keep all public comments to the Board within three minutes. Thank you *
I. **Call to Order:** The regular meeting of the Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority (Nashville MTA) Board of Directors was held at WeGo Central Office, 400 Dr. Martin L. King Jr. Blvd, Nashville, TN 37219 on Thursday, May 23, 2019

Present: Gail Carr Williams, Chair; Hannah Paramore Breen, Member; Glenn Farner, Member; Walter Searcy, Member; Secretary Margaret Behm; and Chief Executive Officer Stephen G. Bland.

A quorum was established, and Vice Chair Janet Miller called the meeting to order at 3:48 p.m.

II. **Approval of Minutes:** Minutes of the April 25, 2019 board meeting were approved.

III. **Public Comments:** Vice Chair Miller opened the floor for public comments. The public was reminded that comments were limited to three minutes. The following members of the public addressed the Board with these comments:

**Glen Graham**
Mr. Graham reported the following:

- He stated that the rerouting information that was distributed to help riders during the NFL draft was highly incorrect. He had to wait over an hour to catch his bus and then had to walk half a mile to get to his destination.

- He stated that he liked the new, simplistic purple and white pocket schedules, but they are too simple, lacking vital information such as major landmarks and destinations and the names of transfer routes.

- He would like for the new route maps to show one-way directions of travel as previously shown on the old route maps.

- Drivers on Route 17 need to be more consistent and take shorter detour Routes. On a recent bus ride, the driver went north on Fifth Avenue, left on James Robertson Pkwy., remained on it until it became Rosa Parks Blvd, which turned into Eighth Avenue South; the driver turned right on Division St., left at Twelfth Ave and back onto the regular route. Anyone waiting for the bus in the Gulch was passed by. Detours need to be short as possible.
• He expressed his appreciation to the staff for getting the fourth gate on the lower level of MCC open for use again.

• He reported that the escalators are constantly breaking down and the water fountains on the lower level of MCC are still not working.

Darius Knight
Mr. Knight reported the following:
• He stated that nobody wants to see route reductions, but he feels that this is the best plan that can be done at the time and appreciates the staff for working overtime to make these changes happen.

• He reported that the same maintenance issues keep being reported, but aren’t getting resolved.

• He stated that WeGo Rapid Routes need to be cleaned.

Peter O’Connor
Mr. O’Connor reported the following:
• He stated that he would like for the old bus stops back at NES because it’s too hard for the people that can’t walk to catch their bus.

• He stated that we should have a 24/7 transit system with the way that Nashville is growing.

• He stated that the escalators at WeGo Central need to be serviced because they are constantly breaking down.

• He stated that people aren’t coming to the public meetings because the meetings are getting way too political.

Rhonda Clark
Ms. Clark reported the following:
• She stated that she’s glad that WeGo Transit is not doing away with On-Demand Service.

• She stated that she feels that fare increases aren’t high enough and that we can afford to go up a bit more.

• She asked how getting rid of the 100 Oaks route would affect Access Ride and On-Demand service.

• She stated that there needs to be designated funds for fixed routes.

Sheila Hanson
Ms. Sheila Hanson reported the following:
• She takes bus 25 to church, but if this route is cut then she doesn’t know how she’s going to get to church.

• She stated that she has the transit app and keeps getting error notifications and wants to know if someone can look into those error notifications.

• She stated that she thinks combining 21 and 25 routes is a good thing, but putting the connector buses closer to downtown isn’t going to save us any money.
There were no other public comments at this time.

IV. **Operations & Finance Committee Report:** Chair Searcy stated that he had no items to report to the board at this time.

V. **New Initiatives and Community Engagement Committee Report:** Vice Chair Janet Miller reported the following:

   a. **Authorization to Take a Series of Fare Increase and Service Reduction & Adjustment Proposals to Public Hearing Prior to Final Consideration by the Nashville MTA Board (M-A-19-015):** CEO Steve Bland reviewed and explained the proposed changes and fare adjustment proposals needed to cover an estimated $8.7 million operation budget deficit.

   The board requested that the detailed board action item be attached as a point of reference to these minutes. The Action Item is included by reference herein and a copy of the Action Item is included in the permanent minute book.

   There was no further discussion, and the board unanimously approved moving forward with public hearing in order for staff to bring a final recommendation at the June board meeting.

VI. **Chair’s Report:** Chair Williams thanked the staff for all of their hard work and she asked the staff not to hesitate to call upon the board members when they need help. Chair Williams concluded her remarks by saying that she’s looking forward to all of the work that is forthcoming.

VII. **CEO’s Report:** CEO Bland reported the following to the Board:

   - I want to recall your attention to pages 13 and 14 in the Committee packet which lists significant upcoming procurements. We’ll include this information in each month’s packet and would ask that you take a look and let us know if you are away of any supplies of the particular goods and services that we should reach out to.
   
   - With respect to Neighborhood Transit Centers, we are continuing negotiations on property for the Clarksville Pike Center, and are preparing an application for the highly competitive Build Act Program to fund construction. We are also advancing design for the Hillsboro Transit Center, in conjunction with the renovation of the school complex.
   
   - You’ve seen all of the coverage of the impact of the NFL Draft last month, with approximately 600,000 in attendance. I want to thank our staff and our customers for their preparation and their patience, as the Draft and the Marathon went off relatively smoothly. We did experience a drop in ridership that week that will be reflected in our April numbers, and we incurred approximately $10,000 in supervisory overtime expenses.
   
   - The focus for many of our staff this month have been preparing for the service reduction and fare adjustment proposals you acted upon earlier. I want to repeat – and I’ll keep doing it – my admiration for the staff involved in designing the
proposed changes. Early on, Gail said to me “I hope we do this with a surgical knife, and not a hatchet, and I certainly think they met and exceeded that challenge. Unfortunately, the issues underlying these service cuts and fare increases are not affected by these proposed changes. What’s called for is a dedicated funding source that is reliable and growing. Otherwise, inflation alone will continue to eat away at our budget, and we’ll be forced to do this again next year.

- My thanks to Gail and Walter for attending our Council Budget Hearing along with Ed, Rita, Eric and myself. The hearing went relatively smoothly, with a number of good questions from those in attendance.

- RTA Items:
  a. The first round of public outreach for the South Corridor Study was completed this past month. There was decent turnout in Columbia, Franklin, Brentwood and Nashville.
  b. Developers are breaking ground next month for a transit oriented development adjacent to the Music City Star station in Mt. Juliet.
  c. Staff are wrapping up work around the negotiation of a purchase agreement to acquire new (used) passenger cars for the Music City Star.

- Finally, Congratulations to our esteemed Board Chair, Gail Carr Williams; and her late husband, David Williams as recipients of the fourth annual Francis S Guess Bridge to Equality Award from the Community Foundation of Middle Tennessee. The award honors the memory of civil rights trailblazer Francis S. Guess, and recognizes those who spur innovation leading to equality. We can’t think of two more deserving recipients than David and Gail.

**VIII. Other Business:** There was no other business to come before the Board.

**IX. Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 4:20 p.m.
BACKGROUND:

Every year, our insurance broker shops the insurance market for renewal of the Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority’s (Nashville MTA) $3 million liability policy with a $100,000 deductible per occurrence. Inquiries were made of seven different insurance companies for the upcoming policy year effective July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2019.

Three companies did not provide quotes due to lack of interest in our fleet make-up or do not quote on municipal fleets, and three only replied that they could not compete with our current quoted prices. The only quote received meeting our scope was from our current insurance company, RLI Insurance (RLI), offering coverage with a $3 million limit and a $100,000 deductible per occurrence. The per vehicle type annual rates for liability coverage compared to our current policy are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Liability Coverage</th>
<th>Current (2018-19)</th>
<th>RLI (2019-20)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transit Bus</td>
<td>$3,139</td>
<td>$3,476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transit Van</td>
<td>$2,197</td>
<td>$2,433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Vehicle</td>
<td>$1,437</td>
<td>$1,719</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When compared to per vehicle type annual rates from other insurance providers that would give us a range, quoted rates ranged from $6,500 to as high as $8,500 per vehicle. The comparison below of total costs incurred is based on the number of vehicles expected to be on hand July 1, 2019 by type of vehicle as quoted above:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Premiums</td>
<td>$816,343</td>
<td>$884,220</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This represents an increase of 8.3% compared to an 8.5% increase last year. The premium will vary slightly depending on the number of vehicles and vehicle types WeGo Public Transit may have in the fleet at any given time.

RECOMMENDATION:

Based upon the information above, the Operations & Finance Committee recommends the Board to authorize the Chief Executive Officer to enter into a contract with RLI Insurance for our liability coverage for the period effective July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020 for $3 million in coverage with a $100,000 deductible for a premium of approximately $884,220.

APPROVED:

______________________________              _________________________________
Board Secretary                               Date

June 27, 2019
BACKGROUND:

A positive working relationship has been established for many years between the Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority (Nashville MTA) and the Regional Transportation Authority of Middle Tennessee (RTA) on regional transit programs.

Each year, the RTA contracts with the Nashville MTA for regional transit services for Davidson/Rutherford County Relax & Ride services to Murfreesboro, Tennessee, as well as connecting bus services to support the commuter train service for the WeGo Star in Nashville, Tennessee. The RTA desires to renew these contracts for the period of July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2020. Since there are different funding sources for the regional bus services and the connecting bus services, two separate contracts are required.

**Contract 1** – Under the new contract for the regional bus services between Davidson and Rutherford counties (Routes 84X, 86X, and 96X), the RTA will pay the Nashville MTA for up to 61.3 hours of daily service at a rate of $109.47 per hour, or an amount not to exceed $1,704,470, covering 254 days of weekday transit service contained in the contract. The $109.47 represents the same contract price compared to the prior year.

**Contract 2** – Under the new contract for connecting bus services operating from Riverfront Station, the RTA will pay the Nashville MTA up to 6.3 hours of daily service at a rate of $109.47 per hour, or $175,174, covering the 254 days of weekday transit service contained in the contract. The $109.47 represents the same contract price compared to the prior year.

A fuel escalator clause will again be included in all of the new contracts to protect the Nashville MTA should the average fuel price escalate above $2.25 per gallon. The clause stipulates that for every 25-cent increase in the monthly average per gallon cost of fuel, the hourly rate will increase $1.50 per hour for that month going forward. This will cover the Nashville MTA’s increase in operating cost due to increased fuel costs. This escalator is above and beyond the contracted amounts mentioned above. This will likely not be a factor since the Nashville MTA has hedged approximately 80% of projected diesel fuel consumption at a contract price of around $2.22 per gallon.

RECOMMENDATION:

The Operations & Finance Committee recommends the Board to renew Contract 1 for regional bus services and Contract 2 for connecting bus services supporting commuter rail. Both of these contracts are for a period of one year beginning July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2020 for the following base amounts:

- **Contract 1** for a not-to-exceed amount of $1,704,470 for regional bus services; and,
- **Contract 2** for a not-to-exceed amount of $175,174 for connecting bus services supporting commuter rail.

APPROVED:

__________________________________              _________________________________
Board Secretary                               Date

June 27, 2019
Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority
of Nashville & Davidson County, Tennessee

Board Action Item

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item Number:</th>
<th>M-A-19-018</th>
<th>Meeting Date:</th>
<th>06/27/19</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Item Title:</td>
<td>MTA-RTA Contract Renewal for State EasyRide Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**BACKGROUND:**

The Regional Transportation Authority of Middle Tennessee (RTA) and the Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority (Nashville MTA) have established a positive working relationship over the years on the regional EasyRide program involving the State of Tennessee.

For several years, the Nashville MTA along with the RTA have participated in the EasyRide program with the State of Tennessee where both agencies provide transit rides to State employees, and the State reimburses both the Nashville MTA and RTA on a cost-per-ride basis. The Nashville MTA has been the principle in this contract with the State of Tennessee and RTA's portion of the rides provided is passed through via a separate agreement with the RTA. The Nashville MTA Board approved a new contract between the Nashville MTA and the State in last month's meeting for the EasyRide Program for July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2020 at a cost per ride set at a weighted average of $2.50 per ride and a total contract not to exceed $1.75 million.

An analysis of state employee ridership for both the Nashville MTA and RTA services was performed, and it affirmed an effective rate of $3.15 per ride should be passed through to RTA from the Nashville MTA since RTA's fares for regional bus service and train service are proportionately higher than the Nashville MTA's fares.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Based upon the explanation above, the Operations & Finance Committee recommends the Board to approve Nashville MTA to enter into a contract with RTA that calls for the Nashville MTA to reimburse RTA for EasyRide trips provided to State employees participating in the EasyRide program at a rate of $3.15 per ride for a period of one year, beginning July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2020.

**APPROVED:**

______________________________  _______________________________
Board Secretary                 Date

June 27, 2019
BACKGROUND:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County Department of Information Technology Services (Metro ITS) provides WeGo Public Transit with information technology services. As part of this technology support, Metro ITS will host the servers for the new account-based fare collection system in their primary data center.

In addition to general licensing and support costs, the scale of the WeGo fare collection project requires Metro ITS to hire a new full-time Oracle Database Administrator. This position will be dedicated to support the first three years of the WeGo fare project implementation. Since it is anticipated that the required level of effort will decrease following initial implementation and burn-in, the percentage of work hours for this position required to support the fare project will be evaluated annually. If the position is no longer required in a full-time capacity for WeGo, an agreed-upon cost-sharing percentage would be established, or Metro ITS will assume full funding for this position. Over the three-year period, the maximum cost of this full-time position is expected to range from $420,000 to $534,000, depending on whether the position is covered via a new Metro employee hire or contractor, respectively. The actual amount incurred by the Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority (Nashville MTA) may be less depending on future agreed-upon cost-sharing percentages.

RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the information above, the Operations & Finance Committee recommends the Board to authorize the Chief Executive Officer to enter into a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) with the Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County Department of Information Technology Services to fund a new full-time equivalent position of Information System Advisor 2 (serving as an Oracle Database Administrator) for up to three years for a not-to-exceed amount of $534,000. Funding for year one of this position is available within the fare collection upgrade project capital budget. Funding for the position for years two and three will be allocated within the annual operating budgets for FY2021 and FY2022.
BACKGROUND:

During its May 23, 2019 meeting, the Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority (Nashville MTA) Board reviewed a broad range of system fare changes and major service reductions and adjustments required to address an $8.7 million operating budget deficit for its fiscal year beginning July 1, 2019. As documented in that meeting, staff applied the following board-accepted criteria in developing the initial set of recommendations for the service and fare changes (in no particular order):

- Assuring social equity in any fare or service change;
- Advancing simplicity, equity, and administrative efficiency goals in fare structure and levels;
- Preserving service quality on routes that carry the overwhelming majority of customers;
- Focusing on reducing or eliminating redundant services;
- Eliminating extremely underperforming services in terms of ridership;
- Applying reductions in a geographically equitable manner;
- Adhering to sound service design principles as are being advanced in our network redesign project, to assure that our system can be even more effective when we are in a position to add back service hours; and,
- Where service must be completely eliminated, making efforts to work individually with anyone who is truly transit dependent and who may have no remaining alternative in an effort to identify other options.
(We must recognize that this will not be possible in all cases.)

This Committee Action Item provides information on the following topics:

- Public Outreach;
- Original Recommendations and Proposed Modifications, including
  - Service Changes,
  - Current Fare Structure Changes, and
  - Future Fare Policy Changes;
- Service and Fare Change Equity Analysis; and
- Request for Authorization to Implement Fare and Service Changes.

PUBLIC OUTREACH

Summary of Public Comment Process

The formal comment period for proposed service and fare changes was open between May 23 and June 27, 2019. WeGo staff held public hearings from May 30 through mid-June as indicated in the table below. Staff presented the proposed fare and service changes to the public at these meetings, answered questions, and received comments for the official record.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Outreach Type</th>
<th>Fare</th>
<th>Routes Focus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>WeGo Central</td>
<td>WeGo Board Meeting</td>
<td>All Changes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Madison Library</td>
<td>Public Hearing (5-7 p.m.)</td>
<td>Fare, 26, 36, 56, 76</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Southeast Community Center</td>
<td>Public Hearing (5-7 p.m.)</td>
<td>Fare, 15, 55</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>East Park</td>
<td>Public Hearing (5-7 p.m.)</td>
<td>Fare, 4, 20, 28, 30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hadley Park</td>
<td>Public Hearing (5-7 p.m.)</td>
<td>Fare, 21, 60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>WeGo Central</td>
<td>Public Hearing (5-7 p.m.)</td>
<td>Fare, 2, 21, 25, Access</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Lentz Public Health</td>
<td>Public Hearing (5-7 p.m.)</td>
<td>Fare, 10, 50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>WeGo Central</td>
<td>Public Hearing (10 a.m. - 6 p.m.)</td>
<td>All Changes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Music City Center</td>
<td>WeGo Board Meeting</td>
<td>All Changes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All meetings were advertised in local newspapers, on the WeGo website, and on social media. Copies of all materials were made available on the project page at WeGoTransit.com, including board materials, public meeting materials, a comprehensive guide to all proposed changes, and news coverage from various outlets. WeGo staff spent more than 100 hours engaging riders at WeGo Central and on affected routes to provide notice of meetings and to receive comments in person.

WeGo received comments through the following methods: public comment forms at public hearings, stenographer recorded comments, Facebook, Twitter, email, and the Customer Care call center. Nearly 200 members of the public attended at least one of our seven meetings, and nearly 600 comments and suggestions were provided through either direct or indirect engagement activities. Themes of these comments ranged from general to specific. Prevailing themes were to keep change cards, raise the base fare to $2, keep the free Circuit bus service on Jefferson Street, improve pedestrian crossings, and secure dedicated funding for transit. Comments associated with specific routes are summarized in the matrix in the next section.

Several comments were received regarding people no longer having one-seat rides to destinations, including having to now make transfers at locations that may have a lack of pedestrian infrastructure or safe waiting areas. WeGo has initiated a discussion with Metro Public Works and Metro Planning on potential pedestrian/rider improvements at key locations where route adjustments will lead to new or increased transfers.

Several commenters requested new park and ride locations for better access to local transit services. WeGo will pursue park and ride opportunities around Davidson County and will consider opportunities on routes close to service eliminations or near coverage gaps to provide another alternative to some impacted riders.

ORIGINAL RECOMMENDATIONS AND PROPOSED MODIFICATIONS

All public comments were reviewed and fully considered in making final recommendations. Not all customer comments could be incorporated, such as comments asking for no service cuts or for preservation of routes with available alternative service. The sections below indicate the original proposed service and fare change recommendations, comments received from the public, and any proposed revisions to the recommendations (highlighted in yellow) based on feedback from the public.
Service Changes

The table below lists the original changes, brief summary of comments, and proposed changes. While all comments were reviewed and carefully considered, the principles underlying the original recommendations represented a clear need to advance the majority of proposed changes as originally presented. An entry of **N/R (No Revision)** means that staff recommends advancing the original proposed change after full consideration of comments.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Initial Route/Proposed Change</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Proposed Revision to Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Route Eliminations and Reductions</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Route 1 – 100 Oaks in its entirety</td>
<td>Request for connectivity to doctors’ offices and for Vine Hill residents</td>
<td>N/R Service to Vine Hill will be sustained on the reconfigured Route 21, though transfers may now be required for what have been one-seat rides.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Route 2 – Belmont in its entirety</td>
<td>Request to maintain service between Belmont, Lipscomb, and Green Hills for students, faculty, seniors, and disabled riders</td>
<td>N/R Service to these locations will be sustained on various routes, though transfers may now be required for what have been one-seat rides.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate service on Marriott loop segment on Route 18 – Airport/ Downtown</td>
<td>Request to keep 7:25 a.m. Marriott loop Request to remain on Murfreesboro Road until after the train tracks then connect to Elm Hill Pike on trips from downtown</td>
<td>N/R Not warranted based on current ridership patterns.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Route 20 – Scott in its entirety</td>
<td>Concern that adjacent service is not walkable and crossing major arterial difficult Request to maintain service to preserve community feel Concern about school children who use this route Request to run limited service in peak periods</td>
<td>N/R Service level and adjacency of alternative routes does not warrant maintaining this service. WeGo will work with Metro Public Works on the need to provide better pedestrian crossing infrastructure. Current ridership does not warrant maintaining peak-only service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Sunday service on Route 21 – University Connector</td>
<td>Concern about loss of connectivity to Green Hills grocery stores, medical offices, and recreation</td>
<td>N/R Not warranted based on current ridership patterns.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Sunday service on Route 25 – Midtown</td>
<td>Request to retain Sunday service due to high ridership</td>
<td><strong>Retain Sunday service</strong> Review of Sunday ridership confirmed high productivity, particularly in conjunction with new route segments to be served in proposed reconfiguration. Requires funding through alternate fare proposal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial Route/Proposed Change</td>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Proposed Revision to Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Route 27 – Old Hickory in its entirety</td>
<td>Concern about school riders. Comment that there is standing room only buses</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate midday trip on Route 33X – Hickory Hollow/Lenox Express</td>
<td></td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Route 36X – Madison Express in its entirety</td>
<td>One comment that this is a rider’s sole means of transportation to work</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Route 37X – Tusculum/McMurray Express in its entirety</td>
<td>Concern that change will be an inconvenience to current riders</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate midday trip on route 38X – Antioch Express</td>
<td></td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Route 44 – WeGo Shuttle – in its entirety</td>
<td>Comment that this is redundant service already</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate downtown segment of Route 60 – Music City Blue Circuit (south of Central)</td>
<td>Concern that the connection between the Riverfront Train Station, WeGo Central, and state offices will also be eliminated</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retain North Nashville/Jefferson Street/TSU segment of the prior Route 29 – Jefferson with normal system fares</td>
<td>Request to retain free service on Jefferson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate Route 61 – Music City Green Circuit in its entirety</td>
<td>Comment that route is mainly used by tourists</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Route 72 – Grassmere/Edmondson Connector – Reduce peak frequency and eliminate Sunday service</td>
<td>No comments submitted</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliminate midday service on 77 – Thompson Connector</td>
<td>Comment on the need for safe pedestrian crossing at Eugenia and Thompson</td>
<td>Maintain midday service. Supports growth trend on route and long-term goal of establishing frequent, all-day crosstown services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial Route/Proposed Change</td>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Proposed Revision to Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Route Consolidations</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consolidate routes 28 – Meridian and 30 – McFerrin</td>
<td>Request safe pedestrian crossing at 9th &amp; Main for Maxwell residents Request to run route as commuter service</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consolidate BRT lite and Local services on the 10/50 – Charlotte Pike, 15/55 – Murfreesboro Pike, and 26/56 – Gallatin Pike corridors Rebrand as WeGo Rapid</td>
<td>Concerns about overcrowding on consolidated buses 10/50 – Concern about Midtown hospitals’ access. 26/56 – Request to improve pedestrian crossings</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Route Realignments</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reroute Route 4 – Shelby</td>
<td>Concern over impact to Rosebank riders Concern that route does not touch North Inglewood with Route 20 elimination</td>
<td>Change routing at the terminal loop to improve connectivity to Gallatin Road service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realign Route 8 – 8th Avenue South and Route 17 – 12th Avenue South</td>
<td>Request for access to 100 Oaks</td>
<td>Extend span to match full service span (and current service span to 100 Oaks) in order to provide comparable service to existing. Requires funding through alternate fare proposal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reroute 21 to serve portions of discontinued Route 1 – 100 Oaks</td>
<td>Concern about loss of connectivity to Green Hills grocery stores, medical offices, and recreation Request to maintain direct service to Belmont and Green Hills</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reroute 25 to eliminate downtown segment, creating a pure crosstown route</td>
<td></td>
<td>Areas of concern will retain service, although transfers may be required where there were formerly one-seat rides.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convert Route 33X – Hickory Hollow/lenox Express from Express to Neighborhood Feeder</td>
<td>Request to extend 52A to Walmart Park &amp; Ride instead Request for school tripper Concern overcrowding on 15/55 during peak hours</td>
<td>N/R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Extension of 52A would be cost prohibitive at this time. Not warranted based on current ridership patterns. Capacity on 15/55 will be monitored.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial Route/Proposed Change</td>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Proposed Revision to Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combine Neely’s Bend and Anderson Lane loops on Route 76 – Madison</td>
<td>Request to continue service to hospital</td>
<td>Change routing near Charter Village Apartments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Current ridership patterns do not warrant maintaining service to hospital.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**WeGo Access and Access-On-Demand**

| WeGo Access – Sustain current service characteristics in terms of coverage, service hours, and other policies. Implement fare increase in conjunction with other fare actions. | Request for expanded hours Request for free service Request for discount for seniors Request to remove ticket mailing fee to compensate for fare increase | N/R WeGo will review the practice of charging a shipping and handling fee for mailing Access tickets to riders |
| WeGo Access on Demand – Make this service permanent (currently running as a pilot) Allow shared rides (trip grouping) in cases where customers are travelling similar directions at similar times Reduce trip mileage before surcharge takes effect from 16 miles to 14 miles Implement fare increase in conjunction with other fare actions | Concern about shared rides | N/R Federal Transit Administration regulations require paratransit services to be operated on a shared-ride basis to remain eligible for Federal funding. |

**Current Fare Structure Changes**

The table below lists all current fare products and associated values, the initial recommendation presented to the Board and the public, and the revised recommendation (in yellow) based on public feedback. WeGo Public Transit staff is recommending, based on public comment, that the original base fare increase to $1.85 be amended to $2 with accompanying alterations to pass and ticket prices as illustrated in the chart below. Under this alternate proposal, change cards would be retained until such time as our pending account-based fare collection system comes online, with transition period (as described below). This recommendation would address customer (and Operator) concerns about the “odd” base fare amount and elimination of change cards. The revised recommendation would also provide funding support for the additional service hours needed to implement the Proposed Revisions to Recommendations in the Service Changes table above.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fare Product</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>$1.85 Base</th>
<th>$2 Base</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ADULT</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-Ride Adult</td>
<td>$1.70</td>
<td>$1.85</td>
<td>$2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All-Day Pass</td>
<td>$3.25</td>
<td>$3.50</td>
<td>$4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-Day Pass</td>
<td>$16.00</td>
<td>$17.50</td>
<td>$20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-Ride</td>
<td>$32.00</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
<td>$40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-Day Pass</td>
<td>$55.00</td>
<td>$60.00</td>
<td>$65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WeGo Public Transit staff also recommended two fare policy changes go into effect on August 1, 2019 along with fare level changes. The first is recommended to be revised and the second advanced as originally recommended:

- Discontinue the issuance of change cards on all vehicles:
  - **REVISED RECOMMENDATION** With a revised recommendation to increase the fare structure under a $2 base fare on August 1, 2019, WeGo staff also recommends continuing to issue and to accept change cards until after the public launch of the new fare system and distribution of new fare cards. This would maintain the acceptance of change cards for 17 months beyond the original recommendation. Recommendation is to eliminate all magnetics (including change cards) by December 31, 2020. Customers will have access to the equivalent of a change card product through a “stored cash” option whereby they can load any denomination of cash they desire onto a fare card (or mobile payment app) and have only the price of the fare product they use deducted from that cash balance.

- Discontinue the acceptance of pennies on all vehicles
  - **No Revision**: A total of two comments were received on this with concern for “other riders”.

**Future Fare Policy Changes**

The following changes are recommended to be advanced as originally presented to the Board and to the public. The only change was to add an implementation date for each item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transfers</td>
<td>Replace onboard paper/magnetic transfer tickets with automated transfers on smart media (smart card, smart ticket, or mobile payment). Transfers would be in the form of a two-hour pass automatically activated when smart media is used on a bus. <strong>Implement with the issuance of the new fare card technology with elimination of all magnetic transfer tickets no later than December 31, 2020.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Onboard Sale of Passes

Cash will continue to be accepted on board vehicles as an accepted fare payment for a single ride. In order to speed the boarding process, no fare media will be sold on board vehicles. **Implement with the issuance of the new fare card technology with elimination of all magnetic transfer tickets no later than December 31, 2020.**

Magnetic Media

Phase out magnetic media once the new system is implemented and all existing products are supported. **Implement with the issuance of the new fare card technology with elimination of all magnetic transfer tickets no later than December 31, 2020.** This includes products such as paper transfers, change cards and one-day passes.

Existing Products

Support all existing fare products on the new fare system (i.e.: period and multi-trip passes and tickets). **Implement with the issuance of the new fare card technology.**

Stored Value

Introduce stored value on transit accounts. Stored value allows customer to add cash to their accounts in increments of their choice, rather than having to purchase specifically priced products. **Implement with the issuance of the new fare card technology.**

Reduced Fare Media

After application process, issue reduced fare (senior/ADA and youth) cards (or register virtual/mobile cards as reduced cards) at Central ticket window. Require all reduced fare products be purchased/loaded to a qualifying reduced fare card/account. Currently, only customers requesting a discount fare on the basis of disability are required to go through an application process. **Implement with the issuance of the new fare card technology.**

Support Third-Party Payment Systems

Design the system to be capable of accepting payment through widely available third-party payments systems, such as ApplePay, Google Wallet, etc. **Implement with the issuance of the new fare card technology.**

Service and Fare Change Equity Analysis

WeGo staff completed a full equity analysis of impacts to people based on race and income for the proposed system and service changes. The full report is located on the WeGo Website as the WeGo 2019 Service and Fare Change Title VI Report.

Based on WeGo Title VI Policy, and consistent with Federal law, adverse effects of changes are borne disproportionately by minority populations when the impacts to minority populations are more than 20% greater than impacts to non-minority populations. Similarly, adverse effects of changes are borne disproportionately by low-income populations when the impacts to low income populations are more than 20% greater than impacts to non-low income populations. This analysis found that the proposed service changes would have 9.1% less impact on minority persons and 4.7% less impact on low-income persons than non-minority and non-low income persons. The analysis found that the proposed fare changes would have 6.8% more impact on minority persons and 2.0% more impact on low-income persons than non-minority and non-low income persons.

The results of the analysis indicated that the recommended service and fare changes would not have a significantly disparate or disproportionate impact on minority or low-income populations.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff requests the New Initiatives & Community Engagement Committee recommend to the Board the approval and adoption of all service and fare changes as revised through public comments and as documented in this item, summarized as follows:

- August 1, 2019: Fare increase associated with the $2 base fare and elimination of pennies;
• August 1, 2019: Access on Demand would become a full service of WeGo Public Transit with a $7 base fare, a 14-mile base distance, and shared rides (trip grouping) allowed on the service;
• September 29, 2019: Service changes including all recommended eliminations and modifications in the Service Changes table implemented;
• Summer 2020: Fare structure changes noted in item associated with implementation of new fare technology system; and,
• December 31, 2020: Elimination of change cards and magnetics from the fare system.

APPROVED:

______________________________________           ___________________________
Board Secretary                              Date

June 27, 2019
Date
Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority  
of Nashville & Davidson County, Tennessee

Board Action Item

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item Number:</th>
<th>M-A-19-021</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Meeting Date:</td>
<td>06/27/19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item Title:</td>
<td>FY2020 Proposed Adoption of Continuation Budget</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BACKGROUND:

Over the last several months, we have had open discussions with the New Initiatives & Community Engagement (NICE) committee and the Nashville Metropolitan Transit Authority (Nashville MTA) Board regarding our FY2020 proposed operating budget and a projected $8.7 million operating deficit. On June 18, Metro Council finalized their FY2019-20 Operating Budget, and with it, the level of operating subsidy to the Nashville MTA (which remains unchanged from last year). Concurrently, we have finalized the tabulation of public comments to date with respect to the proposed service reduction and fare increase plan that the Board authorized for public comment in May. Earlier in the agenda, you were asked to act on the final staff recommendations resulting from that process.

Given that the proposed FY2019-20 Operating Budget cannot be finalized until we know, with certainty, the direction the Board will take with respect to fare and service decisions, we are recommending the adoption of a “continuation budget” until these decisions are finalized and a final budget proposal can be developed. Under the continuation budget, we would simply maintain authorized spending levels at the FY2018-19 level until a substitute budget is adopted. This will have no material impact on operations, as additional revenues generated by any fare increase will not be recognized until August (if adopted for August 1 implementation, as recommended), and savings from reduced service levels will not be recognized until October (if adopted for September 29 implementation, as recommended).

RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the explanation above, the New Initiatives & Community Engagement Committee recommends to the Board to approve a continuation budget based upon the current FY2019 Operating Budget until the approved service and fare changes can be incorporated into a final FY2020 Operating Budget. The final proposed FY2020 Operating Budget will be presented to the Board for consideration in the July 2019 or no later than the August 2019 Board meeting.

APPROVED:

__________________________________              ________________________________
Board Secretary                               Date

June 27, 2019